

PAUL STARR

# Remedy and Reaction

THE PECULIAR AMERICAN STRUGGLE  
OVER HEALTH CARE REFORM

Yale UNIVERSITY PRESS  
NEW HAVEN & LONDON

Copyright © 2011 by Paul Starr.

All rights reserved.

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, including illustrations, in any form (beyond that copying permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law and except by reviewers for the public press), without written permission from the publishers.

Yale University Press books may be purchased in quantity for educational, business, or promotional use. For information, please e-mail sales.press@yale.edu (U.S. office) or sales@yaleup.co.uk (U.K. office).

Set in Scala type by Westchester Book Group.

Printed in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Starr, Paul, 1949–

Remedy and reaction : the peculiar American struggle over health care reform / Paul Starr.

p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-300-17109-9 (cloth : alk. paper)

1. Health care reform—United States—History. 2. Medical policy—United States—History. I. Title.

[DNLM: 1. Health Care Reform—history—United States.

2. History, 20th Century—United States. 3. History, 21st Century—United States. 4. Insurance Coverage—history—United States.

5. Insurance, Health—history—United States. 6. Politics—United States. WA 11 AA1]

RA395.A3S768 2011

362.10973—dc23

2011019577

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

This paper meets the requirements of ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992  
(Permanence of Paper).

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

## CONTENTS

Preface and Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction: An Uneasy Victory	1
The Making of a National Impasse	3
A Window for Reform	12
Choices and Vulnerabilities	17

### PART I. THE GENEALOGY OF HEALTH-CARE REFORM

1 Evolution through Defeat	27
Progressive Health Insurance, 1915–1919	29
The New Deal and National Health Insurance, 1935–1950	35
The Growth of the Protected Public, 1950–1965	41
2 Stumbling toward Comprehensive Reform	51
Political Deadlock, 1969–1980	52
Political Reversals, 1981–1990	63
The American Path in Health Insurance	72

### PART II. FRUSTRATED AMBITIONS, LIBERAL AND CONSERVATIVE

3 The Shaping of the Clinton Health Plan, 1991–1993	79
---	----

	A New Framework	83
	Clinton's Decisions	90
<b>4</b>	Getting to No, 1994	103
	The Democrats' Disorder	104
	The Big Turnabout	112
	The Collapse of Congressional Compromise	119
	Why No Reform?	122
<b>5</b>	Comes the Counterrevolution, 1995–2006	129
	Gingrich and the End of Entitlements	131
	From Bold Leaps to Baby Steps	138
	A Republican Window	146
	Return to Crisis	155
<b>PART III. ROLLERCOASTER</b>		
<b>6</b>	The Rise of a Reform Consensus, 2006–2008	161
	Romney and the Massachusetts Model	163
	Toward Minimally Invasive Reform	174
	Making 2008 a Health-Care Election	182
	Prepare to Launch	190
<b>7</b>	Breaking Through, 2009–2010	194
	Health Care First	196
	Bipartisanship in One Party	201
	Reaction and Resolve	211
	Obama and the Rollercoaster to Reform	220
	Why Health-Care Reform Passed (and Climate Legislation Didn't)	235
<b>8</b>	The Affordable Care Act as Public Philosophy	239
	Fairness and Equality	241
	Responsibility and Freedom	247
	Federalism and Finance	252
	Health and the Public Household	259

CONTENTS

ix

9 Reform's Uncertain Fate	267
Political Backlash and the Courts	269
The Peculiar Struggle	279
Notes	283
Index	310